A Review of Educational Problems in Rural Areas of Sindh: Role of Private NGOs

Masood Hassan[1], Muhammad Sufyan Ramish[2], Waqas Bin Dilshad[3]

[1]Assistant Professor, BSB, BBSUL, Karachi, Pakistan, masoodhassan1@hotmail.com
[2]Assistant professor, Karachi Institute of Economics and Technology (KIET), Karachi, Pakistan. sufyan.ramish@kiet.edu.pk
[3]Assistant Professor, BSB, BBSUL, Karachi, Pakistan.Waqas@bbsul.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS	ABSTRACT
	Purpose: No country can fulfill its objectives without a well-educated labor force, and that is why education is such an important part of national growth and development. Education is a strong weapon for social transformation, but depriving it of fundamental necessities shows that it has failed. This study has been carried out just to know the education concerns of rural areas of Sindh with the important role of NGOs plays in a country's growth for the development of its citizens' moral, social, and cultural creativity. **Methodology:** The literature review has been done in the formation of this study while the approach taken in this literature review was motivated by the work of Suikkala and Leino-Kilpi (2001) and Evans (2002). The Google search engine and the Google Scholar database were used to discover articles and books published between January 1999 and January 2022. Only works first published in English were considered. **Findings:** Physical distance to school, teacher hiring in rural area, spotty internet access, poverty and non-entrepreneurial teachers are the challenges of the education system. **Conclusion:** Problems of education in rural areas exist not only in Pakistan but throughout the world while supporting role of private NGOs is the dire need of education system in rural Sindh.

Corresponding author's email address:masoodhassan1@hotmail.com

1. Introduction

In what ways can we tell the difference between a rural and urban setting? The Proposal on Agri-Environmental Indicators (Burton & Schwarz, 2013), the Hay Report (Vidal et al., 2005), Eurostat (2002), and an OECD initiative are just a few of the European organizations and gatherings used to promote and improve rural regions (OECD, 1996). Generally speaking, these groups use demographic data, statistics on economic activity, and social or well-being indices to separate rural areas from metropolitan places. This typology was developed by the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) in 1996 and updated in 2009. First, rural areas are those in which the population density is less than 150 people per square kilometer. The proportion of people living in rural areas is a secondary criterion to categorize regions. Consequently, they are grouped into the following:

•Predominantly rural areas, if more than half of the population resides in rural settlements.
•Predominantly urban regions if fewer than 15% of the population resides in rural areas.
•Significantly rural areas, for intermediate regions where the proportion of the people living in rural settlements is between 15% and 50%.

One of education's most important roles in a country's growth is the development of its citizens' moral, social, and cultural creativity (Sahlberg,2006). Education, according to Siddiqui and Adams (2013), "not only distinguishes live beings from dead, but also brings about quick growth and development." Every human being has a fundamental right to education. Education is an essential human right for all human beings, regardless of age, gender, or religion, as stated by Hashmi (2016). Only an educated individual is capable of making the correct choice at the appropriate moment. It's impossible for any nation to reach its objectives without a well-educated workforce. For a nation to flourish and prosper, education is a vital component. Without knowledge, no country has a clear understanding to best use its resources. There's still more. "No country can succeed in globalization without education," remarked Siddiqui and Adams (2013). The majority of a society's wealth is built on the backs of its students, who represent its most valuable asset. Only those countries that put a high priority on education were able to achieve progress. According to Hashmi (2016), the only countries that have achieved progress and development in the globe are those that have a good education system. Pakistan is a developing nation with a large population, and it is the most populous.

"Pakistan is one of the most populous nations in the world," says Khan (2010). Rural regions account for the majority of the country's overall population, which exceeds 50%. The vast majority of such people are illiterate and unconvinced of the value of education. As a result, they do not send their children to school. Literacy in Pakistan is defined as "a person who can read a newspaper and write a basic letter, in any language," yet this definition is not in accordance with international norms ("Needs," 2008).

As Hashmi (2016) points out, in Pakistan, the whole educational system lacks fundamental necessities such as basic infrastructure, a lack of teacher commitment, and a shortage of libraries, scientific labs, and computer laboratories, to name just a few. Compared to other industrialized nations, Pakistan's education institutions are underfunded, and this is a major contributing factor. Only 2% of Pakistan's GDP is allocated to the education sector by the country's government (Rashid & Mukhtar, 2012). Rural schools are in much worse shape and provide far fewer amenities than their

metropolitan counterparts as a result of a lack of funding (Abel & Sewell,1999). According to Ahmad et al. (2013), "The circumstances of elementary schools are more dismal in rural regions than in metropolitan ones". Because of the poor conditions in rural schools, a large percentage of pupils no longer want to attend school. They quit school at a young age because they were fed up.

An educational institution's denial of fundamental necessities shows that it has failed to make a difference in society. It is impossible for any one country to fulfill its stated objective at this crucial juncture, and the global literacy rate will not rise (Nussbaum, 2003).

1.1. The Education Equation

All across the globe, there are issues with schooling in rural communities. Instructors may better evaluate and meet the needs of their students by including all parties involved in the learning process, including students, teachers, and families. Teachers are better able to tailor lessons to their pupils' specific requirements when they build strong connections among the many constituents (Ottenbreit et al., 2010).

Families typically have a crucial role in the academic performance of children who live in rural areas. In order to establish a learning environment that is accessible to all students, it is important to communicate clearly with parents about your expectations for learning and conduct. This promotes a culture of responsibility among students and their families, as well as increases their sense of agency in the classroom (Keaney, 2011).

1.2. Equity in Learning

It might be challenging for rural pupils to link new knowledge with their earlier experiences. In many cases, kids in rural areas lack the life experiences that other students have since their families and communities tend to be more isolated. This might restrict their capacity to benefit completely from a diversified educational experience. Additionally, children in rural areas lack the opportunity to take advantage of advanced placement courses that are more readily accessible in urban and suburban districts (Goodpaster et al., 2012).

It may be a lengthy and frustrating process to get these resources into a rural school district, but officials tend to react favorably when presented with feasible alternatives. Encouraging administrators to take positive action on behalf of the kids they represent may be a powerful motivator (Schweiger et al., 1989).

A lack of financial flexibility in rural districts means that rural pupils do not have regular access to high-quality early reading initiatives. For example, while many students in rural areas have easy access to local libraries, their school districts may lack the time or resources to build beneficial relationships with the library system that would encourage families and students to take advantage of these resources, particularly at the preschool level (Bailey, 2021).

Teachers in the classroom are well-versed in modifying resources and devising curricula that increase student learning opportunities while requiring little to no more financial investment on their part. The inability to read and understand grade-level texts in every topic is a major hurdle for many struggling pupils. Rural students who may have difficulty accessing the curriculum will have a better chance of succeeding if you change

the texts that they are expected to read or front-load crucial vocabulary or other necessary information (Bailey, 2021).

A lack of money in rural regions may also prevent many students from having regular access to technology, preventing them from taking part in educational activities that are more interesting and engaging in general (Bailey, 2021). Education seems to be the most pressing issue facing our nation. Almost 90% of individuals in rural regions are illiterate. This is due to the local people's ancestors. Everyone has a role to play in agriculture. Agriculture is the sole source of income for farmers, and it is the only source of income for farmers (Latif, 2009).

According to Articles.pk, rural regions have a low population density for a number of reasons. This is due to the fact that no one is making educational investments in the area. The government has the most important function. The government has never made any efforts in this area. As a teacher, it is my responsibility to ensure that the classroom is a safe and welcoming place for students to study. Every parent, however, never tries to coerce a kid. When they're young, they like to make mud pots. As time goes on, their parents demand that they assist them in their job. Every family has a valuable asset in an older son. Another issue they encounter is a lack of income. They put in a lot of effort, yet they never get a dime of reward for it. This is due to the fact that they are ignorant and just care about being fed. When a buyer comes along and buys their lands for a modest sum of money, they resell them for a large sum of money. You can't make an informed decision if you lack information. You just carry out the necessary actions. To put it another way, it's crucial. Whether it's a matter of money or math, they're constantly up against obstacles. Anyone who wants to learn always quits since there is no one to keep them going. Rural regions only have 10 to 20 percent of the nation's schools, yet there is zero housing. It's up to us to fix it. In order to inspire them, the younger generation uses social media, while those who have power labor for and visit them (Articles.pk, 2015).

2. Literature Review

Rural education issues include the following:

• Physical distance between children and school
• Difficulty finding instructors willing to relocate
• Poor internet connection
• Poverty
• Educators have to be entrepreneurial (Tutordoctor,2017)

2.1.   Physical Distance of Students to School

City inhabitants may legitimately expect to be able to walk their children to school, but in rural places, this is sometimes difficult. Because of the size of certain catchment regions, getting a ride to school is a must. After-school events and sports sometimes have to be postponed because students must ride school buses to get there, which adds up. Long bus rides have been related to worse academic performance in studies. But what can be done about rural education? The simplest answer would be to create more schools, but in fact, rural schools are closing and bus journeys are increasing longer (Tutordoctor, 2017).

2.2. Teacher Hiring

A shortage of teaching positions in many metropolitan areas means that there is a surplus of highly qualified instructors. Rural communities, on the other hand, have a hard time attracting the best instructors. In fact, rural places have a harder time finding workers in a wide range of disciplines, even those outside of education. Simpler living isn't for everyone, and for others, living in the country is a life that's "less than" (Tutordoctor, 2017).

Health care might be more difficult to come by, and there may be a lack of cultural attractions compared to larger cities, thus instructors may be put off by the prospect of working in rural locations. To be honest, there is a slew of advantages to living and teaching in the country that you won't find in the city, such a less expensive cost of living and a strong feeling of community. Rural schools may have difficulty filling positions due to a lack of qualified candidates due to negative public perceptions. A more common strategy is to provide greater compensation or perks, although this might be expensive (Tutordoctor, 2017).

2.3. Spotty Internet Access

Its common knowledge that broadband Internet service is available in large cities. Fast access is not only simple to sign up for, but consumers living in cities are typically presented with an abundance of options. According to some estimates, almost a third of rural inhabitants in the United States do not have access to broadband Internet (Tutordoctor, 2017).

Schools in rural areas might suffer greatly if they don't have access to high-speed Internet. Many instructors are unable to use digital resources like YouTube or learning management systems (LMSs) like Moodle in the classroom for a variety of reasons. Sometimes it's difficult to accept homework and assignments that are submitted electronically. Slow Internet connections can deny students access to digital learning, eBooks, and online collaboration. Rural schools may have a hard time taking use of even the most basic tools, such as Google Docs. Slow progress is being made in rural regions to provide internet availability (Tutordoctor, 2017).

2.4. Poverty

Rural regions have greater rates of unemployment, starvation, and poverty than metropolitan ones, yet no location is completely devoid of poverty. Poverty is harder to perceive in rural regions than it is in urban ones because of the lower density of people. This makes it more difficult to deal with. Poverty has been linked to worse academic achievement and higher rates of absenteeism (or early drop-outs). If a rural school district has a lot of pupils, it's not uncommon for instructors to be unaware of how their students are doing because of the huge distances they cover (Tutordoctor, 2017).

2.5. Teachers Need to be Entrepreneurial

Rural communities in the United States have a greater rate of entrepreneurship than the rest of the country. It's possible that rural residents are more used to getting things done on their own due to a distinct attitude or difficulties in acquiring help. This also applies to the field of education. Students benefit more from a teacher who can get in and get things done in rural regions than one who is accustomed to dealing with bureaucracy. As a result, it is common practice in rural regions for a superintendent to double as a principal and sometimes even a bus driver. An attitude of "It's not my job" may be detrimental in a

society where everyone contributes, making it difficult for instructors who are accustomed to specialization (Tutordoctor, 2017).

3. Research Methodology

The literature review has been done in the formation of this study while the approach taken in this literature review was motivated by the work of Suikkala and Leino-Kilpi (2001) and Evans (2002). The Google search engine and the Google Scholar database were used to discover articles and books published between January 1999 and January 2022. Only works first published in English were considered.

4. Discussion

4.1. The Universal Right to Education

Since 1948, when the Universal Declaration of Human Rights declared that all children in all countries should have access to free and compulsory elementary education, the aim of attaining UPE has been on the worldwide agenda. Many international treaties and United Nations conference statements have reaffirmed this goal (Stephano,2014).

4.2. Right to Education in Pakistan & Sindh

In wake of the universal declarations for Education, in Pakistan, the Right to Education for every child and citizen was promulgated through the Constitution Article 25A: RIGHT TO EDUCATION. The Article Reiterates that The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law4. In Sindh, this aspect of Education for All was also reinforced by the Provincial Government through THE SINDH RIGHT OF CHILDREN TO FREE AND COMPULSORY EDUCATION ACT, 20135. Article 25-A of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan's 1973 Constitution stipulates that all children between the ages of five and sixteen have the right to a free and obligatory education (HANDS,2022).

4.3. Quality of Education

People all across the world are searching for high-quality education on a daily basis since they all need it. Education providers in the nation as well as the government are keeping an eye on this problem. However, in the age of decentralization, it is still unclear what types and extents of responsibilities various stakeholders will play in increasing educational quality. To guarantee the quality of education and the services that follow, educational institutions and society must work together. Quality education is essential to the long-term viability of the economy and society as a whole (HANDS,2022).

According to UNICEF[6], quality education is characterized by five factors: I the learner's external experiences, (ii) the learning environment, (iii) the educational content, (iv) the educational processes, and (v) educational results. For learners to obtain a high-quality education, all five components must be present. Corollary to these above five elements, the importance of associated supplementary as well as complimentary factors were also identified for higher, qualitative achievements and attainments in education by the students. The following factors are summarized: Learners must be in good health, receive adequate nutrition, and receive support from their families and communities. The setting

---

[4] Article: 25A Right to Education, https://pakistanconstitutionlaw.com/article-25a-right-to-education/
[5] THE SINDH RIGHT OF CHILDREN TO FREE AND COMPULSORY EDUCATION ACT, 2013. SINDH ACT NO. XIV OF 2013;
NO.PAS/Legis-B-07/2013-The Sindh Right of Children to free and Compulsory Education Bill, 2013 passed by the Provincial Assembly of Sindh on 13th February, 2013 and assented by the Governor of Sindh on 6th March, 2013.
www.sindheducation.gov.pk/Contents/Menu/Sindh_Bill_RTFE.pdf
[6] UNICEF, *What is the Meaning of Quality Education?*
https://www.reference.com/education/meaning-quality-education-9f71b66a05760ce4

in which students study should be safe, healthy, and stimulating. Appropriate education content is relevant to the student and is delivered in an orderly classroom. The consequences of learning should foster social involvement (HANDS,2022).

4.4.   Measuring Quality of Education

An important aspect of the Quality of Education is its measurement and interpretation. In this regard several important areas were postulated by UNICEF7: Outcomes are used to evaluate the quality of education. Accomplishments of students should be commensurate with their grade level, age, and other factors, as well as national norms. The Detroit News offered a number of measures in 2014 to assist youngsters in Michigan to get high-quality education in accordance with the preceding criteria (HANDS,2022).

Because they are quantifiable, they may be used in Pakistan for management and meaningful results that have a decisive impact. There should be equal funding for all schools; parents and students should have easy access to a grading system for schools based on data; schools should be required to meet high standards or closed if they don't meet them; schools that don't meet high standards should be closed (HANDS,2022).

4.5.   The School Enrollments Situation

At the onset it is deemed fit to present a picture of the School Enrollments Situation in the country as depicted by UNICEF: To guarantee that all children, especially the most vulnerable, are able to attend, remain, and learn in school is a major concern in Pakistan. Education metrics in Pakistan are increasing, although improvement is lagging behind the national average. About 22.8 million youngsters between the ages of 5 and 16 don't go to school. For children ages 5 to 16, Pakistan has the world's second-largest number of out-of-school children (OOSC), accounting for 44 percent of the overall population in this age range. More than five million children between the ages of 5 and 9 are not enrolled in school, and the figure rises to 11.4 million teenagers between the ages of 10 and 14 who are not enrolled in school. In Sindh, 52% of the poorest children (58%) are out of school, while in Balochistan, 52% of the poorest children (58%) are out of school, and 78 percent of girls are out of school [8](HANDS,2022).

Children between the ages of 5 and 16 are estimated by NIPS to number 51.53 million in Pakistan. Only 28.68 million of these children are enrolled in pre-kindergarten through high school in both the public and private sectors, leaving an additional 22.84 million youngsters without a schooling option. Distribution of this estimated number of School Children shows that out of the estimated number of 12743238 Middle School Children of 10-12 years of age, 51% were out of School. Similarly, data for High School children of 13-14 years age show that out of 8269609 children, 60% were out of School. The situation for the Higher Secondary Schools was bad: Out of 8168590 students 15-16 years of age, 77% were out of School (HANDS,2022).

Children between the ages of 5 and 16 are estimated by NIPS to number 51.53 million in Pakistan. Only 28.68 million of these children are enrolled in pre-kindergarten through high school in both the public and private sectors, leaving an additional 22.84 million youngsters without a schooling option. Distribution of this estimated number of School Children shows that out of the estimated number of 12743238 Middle School Children of 10-12 years of age, 51% were out of School. Similarly, data for High School children of

---

[7] UNICEF, ibid
[8] Unicef for every child, Education, https://www.unicef.org/pakistan/education

13-14 years age show that out of 8269609 children, 60% were out of School. The situation for the Higher Secondary Schools was bad: Out of 8168590 students 15-16 years of age, 77% were out of School (HANDS,2022).

As stated by UNDP in 2013, Pakistan's adult literacy rate is just 54.9%, but the primary school dropout rate is much higher at 34.8%. Females are also less likely than men to attend school. The government spends barely 2.4 percent of GDP on education, and there is little focus on the quality of education at any level of schooling. Many parents are reluctant to enroll their children in state-run schools because of the poor quality of their children's education, which hinders the country's progress. Instead, parents retain their children so that they might learn a trade and contribute to the family's financial well-being. When it comes to education, parents, on the other hand, tend to send their children to school. Most of the time, schools managed by non-profit organizations are more affordable, with lower tuition and higher academic standards (Gul,2015).

In today's world, education is the most important instrument for long-term growth. Education has a direct impact on the quality of life in all three areas: economic, social, and environmental. Another effective development technique is health care, which has both immediate and long-term advantages (Hertzman & Wiens,1996).

The link between education and health care is essential because not only does access to family planning services correlate with access to education, but they are often found together. As a result of better health care and educational opportunities, fertility declines are more likely to occur (Ensor & Cooper, 2004). Prosperity, attitude, per capita income, savings, an appropriate choice for family matters, and everlasting happiness are all factors that NGOs in Pakistan play a significant part in achieving (Nawaz et al., 2019).

The term "NGO" refers to a non-profit organization that manages both international organizations and sovereign governments (Cooley & Ron, 2002). In most cases, they are funded entirely via private contributions, although other organizations choose to operate entirely on the generosity of their donors (Nunnenkamp & Ohler, 2012). Different non-governmental groups throughout the globe focus on various issues and use a variety of tactics to achieve their goals (Lewis,2003). There are humanitarian NGOs, but there are also NGOs that are likely to be exempt from paying taxes because of their social missions (Seybolt, 2007). When the United Nations was formed in 1945, the phrase "non-governmental organization" was coined (Martens, 2002). International liaisons union was formed in 1910 by 132 international non-governmental groups that collaborated with one another.

Nongovernmental organizations, on the other hand, specialize in volunteer activity since they don't operate for profit (Yator,2012). Non-governmental groups have grown steadily over the last several decades and play a critical role in the well-being of the community (Ma, 2005). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in Pakistan nowadays are mostly philanthropic organizations that rely heavily on donations from volunteers for those led by specialists (Ma, 2005). Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) in Pakistan are typically registered with the Pakistani government (Bano, 2008). Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) are committed to helping individuals and the nation grow and prosper (Kennedy & Dornan, 2009). By developing and promoting grassroots institutions in both urban and rural regions, most non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are working on a participatory strategy (Amin & Becker, 1998). Common economic interests, closeness to one another geographically, and social acceptability all played a

role in how this grassroots organization came to be formed. NGO success stories and examples may be found all throughout the world (Miller, 2000; Roberts, 2003; Mitlin, 2016). Government, non-governmental groups, and even social entrepreneurs have the ability to reproduce them (Ghauri et al., 2014). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have made several interventions in the education system, both in the informal and official sectors (Ahmad, 2003). Non-governmental organizations manage hundreds of thousands of schools across the globe, when there are no government schools for the poor and the government cannot afford to pay for their children's education (Walford, 2011).

4.6.   Evolution of NGOs in Pakistan

It is possible to classify the development of non-governmental organizations in Pakistan according to the Asian Development Bank's (2009) timeline as the initial voluntary organizations that were engaged in rehabilitation work and thus contributed to the newly established nation and government in Pakistan in 1947 (Gul, 2015). There was no change in the structure of NGOs until the 1970s. There was a significant shift toward socialism in government thought after the eastern division of Pakistan in the 1970s, and the provision of public services was increasingly seen as the province's duty (Career services, 2014). In the 1980s, NGOs restructured themselves and received full government backing and financing because of the war in Afghanistan and US involvement in every aspect of Pakistani society (Gul, 2015).

According to UNDP (2010), it is difficult to quantify the number of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in Pakistan since these organizations may be established under five different laws and in several provinces and districts, however, the figure fluctuates from 8,000 to 12,000. (Gul, 2015). This year's annual report from the State Bank of Pakistan categorizes non-governmental organizations (NGOs) into five groups based on the nature of their activity, including those active in lobbying, policy concerns, disaster management, and other activities (Gul,2015). Most non-profit organizations (80%) don't get any donations and 60% of non-profit organizations (60%) don't make any money from their activities. Some non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have done particularly well in Pakistan, such as FPAP (Iqbal, 2010).

4.7.   Govt.-NGO Relations

Government interactions with nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) have been studied extensively in the literature, and it was found that the Pakistani government is a favorable one, as represented in the Social Action Plan (2010) phase-II and the Eighth Five Year Plan (2010) (Hulme,2008). Pakistan, in terms of the relationship between the government and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), is one of the most advanced countries in the world (Hussain,2005). Research conducted by another group indicated that middle-level bureaucracy impedes NGO-government collaboration (Sarwar,2007). In Pakistani governmental-nongovernmental organization ties, the research found four main tendencies, as follows: There are four types of NGOs: those who set up operations overnight, receive funding, and then disappear after using it, and don't want to have any relationship with the government; those who have been around for a while and look to the government as partners; those who portray the government as corrupt; and those who portray themselves as a replacement for the government (Gul,2015).

4.8. Sindh Govt. Gives Control of 71 Schools to Private Sector for 10 Years

Syed Murad Ali Shah, the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) Mission Director Julie Koenen (virtually), and Minister for Education and Literacy Saeed Ghani witnessed the signing of an agreement between the Sindh Government and Education Management Organizations (EMOs) to manage 71 USAID-constructed schools for the next 10 years, according to the Daily Times (2020). On Wednesday, a ceremony was conducted at CM House to transfer the administration of the newly built schools under the USAID Sindh Basic Education Program (SBEP) to the EMOs. In accordance with social distancing standards, members of the Sindh government and the EMO attended the event in person while USAID officials took part electronically. For the next 10 years, Ahmed Bakhsh Narejo signed agreements with officials from the Charter for Compassion (CFC) and the Health and Nutrition Development Society (HANDS) (Daily Times,2020).

5. Conclusion

A private NGO's involvement in rural Sindh is shown in the literature, which emphasizes the necessity of education in rural Sindh. Education in Pakistan, especially in less developed rural regions where the public sector is still unable to offer necessary educational facilities, might benefit from the help of many hands. An educational institution's denial of fundamental necessities shows the inability of the institution to bring about change in society. It is impossible for any country to fulfill its stated objective of increasing its literacy rate at this crucial juncture. Rural education challenges include a lack of instructors willing to relocate, a lack of internet access, poverty, and the need for educators to be self-starters.

We need a thorough investigation of Pakistan's non-governmental organizations trying to improve education, as well as a recommendation for how they should be held accountable. Studies on the responsibilities of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in Pakistan are needed since the existing NGO registration process is complicated and unclear (Bari et al., 2005). Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) play a vital role in Pakistan's government, particularly when it comes to providing educational opportunities for the country's poorest citizens. As a result, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are becoming more prominent in Pakistan. It has been established that education is the sole means of progressing as a person or a country. Education has a favorable effect on people's attitudes and conducts in general, not just the respondents' present patterns of behavior.

References

Abel, M. H., & Sewell, J. (1999). Stress and burnout in rural and urban secondary school teachers. The journal of educational research, 92(5), 287-293.

Ahmad, I., Rauf, M., Rashid, A., ur Rehman, S., & Salam, M. (2013). Analysis of the problems of primary education system in Pakistan: Critical review of literature. Academic Research International, 4(2), 324.

Ahmad, M. M. (2003). Distant voices: the views of the field workers of NGOs in Bangladesh on microcredit. Geographical Journal, 169(1), 65-74.

Amin, R., & Becker, S. (1998). NGO-promoted microcredit programs and women's empowerment in rural Bangladesh: quantitative and qualitative evidence. The journal of developing areas, 32(2), 221-236.

Bailey, D. (2021). Addressing the Challenges of Rural Students. Retrieved from https://www.edutopia.org/article/addressing-challenges-rural-students

Bano, M. (2008). Non-profit education providers vis-à-vis the private sector: comparative analysis of non-governmental organizations and traditional voluntary organizations in Pakistan. Compare, 38(4), 471-482.

Bari, F., Ejaz, N., & Faheem, A. (2005). Role of NGOs in primary education in Pakistan: An introduction. The Role of NGOs in Basic and Primary Education in Pakistan, 1.

Burton, R. J., & Schwarz, G. (2013). Result-oriented agri-environmental schemes in Europe and their potential for promoting behavioural change. Land Use Policy, 30(1), 628-641.

Career Services (2014). Non-Governmental Organizations. Retrieved from http://careerservices.colorado.edu/CommonFiles/PDFs/students/fastNGOs.pdf

Cooley, A., & Ron, J. (2002). The NGO scramble: Organizational insecurity and the political economy of transnational action. International security, 27(1), 5-39.

Daily Times (2020, July 23). Sindh govt gives control of 71 schools to private sector for 10 years. Retrieved from https://dailytimes.com.pk/644374/sindh-govt-gives-control-of-71-schools-to-private-sector-for-10-years/

Education and Literacy Department: (2022, January 28). Retrieved from https://hands.org.pk/our-services/education-literacy/#early-childhood-development

Education of a Girl is the education of Nation (2022, January 28). Retrieved from https://hands.org.pk/education-of-a-girl-is-the-education-of-nation/

Ensor, T., & Cooper, S. (2004). Overcoming barriers to health service access: influencing the demand side. Health policy and planning, 19(2), 69-79.

Eurostat (2002). Nelle PMI Italiane avanza la tecnologia, Retrieved from http://www.smau.it/smau.

Garcia-Vidal, F. J., Martin-Moreno, L., & Pendry, J. B. (2005). Surfaces with holes in them: new plasmonic metamaterials. Journal of optics A: Pure and applied optics, 7(2), S97.

Ghauri, P., Tasavori, M., & Zaefarian, R. (2014). Internationalisation of service firms through corporate social entrepreneurship and networking. International marketing review.

Goodpaster, K. P., Adedokun, O. A., & Weaver, G. C. (2012). Teachers' perceptions of rural STEM teaching: Implications for rural teacher retention. The Rural Educator, 33(3).

Gul, W. (2015). Role of NGOs in Education from Pakistani Context. Journal on Innovation and Sustainability RISUS, 6(2), 139-145.

HANDS (2022). A Study of Stakeholder Perception Regarding Quality Education in

EMO RFP # 5 [*Unpublished manuscript*]

Hashami, M. F. (2016). The Main Problems of the Students at Primary Level Inrural Area Oftehsil: Ferozwala, District: Sheikhupura-Pakistan. International Journal of Education (IJE), 4(1).

Hertzman, C., & Wiens, M. (1996). Child development and long-term outcomes: a population health perspective and summary of successful interventions. Social science & medicine, 43(7), 1083-1095.

Hiatt-Michael, D. B. (2001). Home-school communication. Promising practices for family involvement in schools, 39-57.

Hulme, D. (2008). Reflections on NGOs and development: The elephant, the dinosaur, several tigers but no owl. Can NGOs make a difference, 337-345.

Hussain, I. (2005). Education, employment and economic development in Pakistan. Education Reform in Pakistan: Building for the Future, 33-45.

Iqbal, J. (2010). Role of non-governmental organizations for the development of basic education in Punjab, Pakistan. Educational Research and Reviews, 5(8), 423-426.

Keaney, M. T. (2011). Examining teacher attitudes toward integration: Important considerations for legislatures, courts, and schools. . Louis ULJ, 56, 827.

Kennedy, K., & Dornan, D. A. (2009). An overview: Tourism non-governmental organizations and poverty reduction in developing countries. Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 14(2), 183-200.

Khan, S. B. (2010). Learning Mathematics at a Distance in Pakistan: Students' Opinions. Distance Learning, 7(3), 34.

Latif, A. (2009). A critical analysis of school enrollment and literacy rates of girls and women in Pakistan. Educational Studies, 45(5), 424-439.

Lewis, D. (2003). Theorizing the organization and management of non-governmental development organizations: Towards a composite approach. Public Management Review, 5(3), 325-344.

Ma, Q. (2005). Non-governmental organizations in contemporary China: Paving the way to civil society?. Routledge.

Martens, K. (2002). Mission impossible? Defining nongovernmental organizations. Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations, 13(3), 271-285.

Miller, S. E. (2000). The Posse Is Coming to Town... Maybe: The Role of United States Non-Governmental Organizations in Software Anti-Piracy Initiatives as China Seeks WTO Accession. ILSA J. Int'l & Comp. L., 7, 111.

Mitlin, D. (2016). Cities for citizens in the Global South: approaches of non-governmental organizations working in urban development. In The Ashgate Research Companion to Non-State Actors (pp. 431-444). Routledge.

Nawaz, A., Hussain Javed, Z., Shabbir, M., Ali Waeem, L., & Mushtaq, A. (2019). Participation of NGOs for development of Socio-Economic status of Employees in Pakistan. European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences: Proceedings, 8(1 (s)), pp-170.

Nunnenkamp, P., & Öhler, H. (2012). Funding, competition and the efficiency of NGOs: An empirical analysis of non-charitable expenditure of US NGOs engaged in foreign aid. Kyklos, 65(1), 81-110.

Nussbaum, M. (2003). Capabilities as fundamental entitlements: Sen and social justice. Feminist economics, 9(2-3), 33-59.

Ottenbreit-Leftwich, A. T., Glazewski, K. D., Newby, T. J., & Ertmer, P. A. (2010). Teacher value beliefs associated with using technology: Addressing professional and student needs. Computers & education, 55(3), 1321-1335.

Rashid, K., & Mukhtar, S. (2012). Education in Pakistan: Problems and their solutions. International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 2(11), 332.

Roberts, J. (2003). The manufacture of corporate social responsibility: Constructing corporate sensibility. Organization, 10(2), 249-265.

Sahlberg, P. (2006). Education reform for raising economic competitiveness. Journal of Educational change, 7(4), 259-287.

Sarwar, N. (2007). Evolution of The Un Human Rights Council. Strategic Studies, 27(1), 127-153.

Schweiger, D. M., Sandberg, W. R., & Rechner, P. L. (1989). Experiential effects of dialectical inquiry, devil's advocacy and consensus approaches to strategic decision making. Academy of Management journal, 32(4), 745-772.

Seybolt, T. B. (2007). Humanitarian military intervention: the conditions for success and failure. SIPRI Publication.

Siddiqui, J. A., & Adams, R. (2013, June). The challenge of change in engineering education: Is it the diffusion of innovations or transformative learning?. In 2013 ASEE Annual Conference & Exposition (pp. 23-1171).

Smith, M. B. (2008). International non-governmental development organizations and their Northern constituencies: development education, dialogue and democracy. Journal of Global Ethics, 4(1), 5-18.

Stephano, G. (2014). The Influence of Misungwi District Educational Leadership on Primary School Teachers in-service Training (Doctoral dissertation, SAUT).

Tutordoctor (2017). Challenges Facing Rural Schools. Retrieved from https://www.tutordoctor.com/blog/2017/june/challenges-facing-rural-schools/

Walford, G. (2011). Low-fee private schools in England and in less economically developed countries. What can be learnt from a comparison?. Compare, 41(3), 401-413.

Welcome to Health and Nutrition Development Society (2022, January 28). Retrieved from https://hands.org.pk/about-us/

Yator, K. A. K. (2012). Utilization of donor funding and its effects on economic development of the intended beneficiaries (Doctoral dissertation).

Zeichner, K. (2010). Rethinking the connections between campus courses and field experiences in college-and university-based teacher education. Journal of teacher education, 61(1-2), 89-99.